

## AN ANALYSIS OF CATEGORY-SHIFTS ON THE COMIC TRANSLATION FROM ENGLISH INTO INDONESIAN IN VISUAL TRANSLATION SUBJECT OF ENGLISH DEPARTMENT TIDAR UNIVERSITY

Anik Sholekhah

English Department, Faculty of Education and Teachers Training, Universitas Tidar

Indonesia

aniksholekhah@gmail.com

### Abstract

Translation comes as the bridge of communication of the people in the world. In the process of translation, the equivalence meaning between source language and target language is very important. Therefore, in the translation of comic from English into Indonesian, the translator used a translation shift to get the equivalence meaning. The objectives of this research are to describe the occurrence of category shift on the comic translation translated by the third semester students in Visual Translation subject of English Department Tidar University and to describe the influences of category shift on transferring meaning from source language into target language. This research applies descriptive qualitative research which is explaining the occurrence of category shift on the comic translation translated by the third semester students of English Department, Tidar University. The data was collected by documentation. The data were analyzed using Catford's theory (1965) of category shift. The finding of the analysis shows that there are four category shifts occur on the comic translation from English into Indonesian. They are structure shift, class shift, unit shift and intra-system-shift. The influence of category shift on the comic translation causes complete meaning increased meaning, decreased meaning, lost meaning and different meaning. The researcher concluded that the dominant of category shift is structure shift and the influence of shift causes the meaning in the TL is complete meaning.

**Keywords – *Translation, Category Shift, Equivalence Meaning, Comic***

### Introduction

Translation is means of changing a text from source language into target language. Karimi in Jayantini (2016:7) defines that translation is changing one language called as the source language (SL) to another language called as the target language (TL). Ordudari in Widarwati (2015) explains that translation is transferring written or spoken in source language text to equivalent written or spoken target language text. It comes as the bridge for communication to reach same understanding in different language. Translation activity appears as one of the solutions to overcome the problem of translating the foreign language into target language for the people who do not know the foreign language. Hussaeni, Pratama & Hartono (2018) states that the translation applied in various texts of the whole fields in the people's life including scientific, literary, religious, philosophical text and etc. Based on the definitions of translation above, it can be concluded that translation is the process of replacement the text, written form or statement from source language into target language. Nida in Hatim (2013:25-27) states that there are three stages of the process of the translation. The first is analysis, in this process the translators analyzes the grammatical relationship and the meaning of the word and word combination in source language text. The second process is the translator transferred the analyzed material from the source language into target language. The last process is



This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/).

restructuring, the goal of this process is to ensure that the translation of SL into TL is similar. In the process of restructuring, there are some revisions.

Doing translation is not easy. Sometimes the translators find some difficulties to establish the lexical item of a sentence in translation. It is caused by the different structure or position of words in source language and target language. Shifting comes as problem-solving for the translators to decrease loss of meaning in translating a text from one language into another language. Akbari (2012) also argues that shift in translation is the one of the best-known and more representative in translation process. Catford in Alzuhdy (2014: 156) divides shifts into two major types; level shift and category shift. Level shift is the shifts from grammar to lexis and vice versa. Level shift occurred when the source language item at one linguistic level (grammar) has a target language equivalent at a different level (lexis). Catford in Karina & Padang (2017) says that category shift is the departures from formal correspondence in translation. Category shift occurs if the source language has different form from the target language. It includes structure shift, class shift, unit shift and intra-system shift.

Shift in translation changes the grammatical structure, content or message from source language. Thus, to get the accurate of translation, the translator tries to find the equivalence the language from source language and target language. Panou (2013) states the central position of translation studies is the concept of equivalence. It means that the equivalence is a central task for the translators. Yarahmadzahi & Moghadam, (2016) (as cited in House, 2001) mentioned that to make the translation to be adequate in the target language, the function of the source language should be equivalent to the target language text. It shows that the translator should be focus on the equality of word, quality, and meaning between SL and TL in translating a language. Catford in Prihastanti (2014) says that meaning equivalence consists of two categorizes which occur in the translation, namely: equivalent meaning and non-equivalent meaning. Equivalent meaning divides into three kinds; they are complete meaning, increased meaning, and decreased meaning. Whereas, non-equivalent meaning is divided into two kinds; they are lost meaning and different meaning.

In this research, the researcher takes translating comic as the data because the researcher finds some translation shift especially category shift in the comic translation. According to Bonnef in Soedarso (2015) comic is an arrangement of images and the aim to give information to the reader. A comic always uses space images with layout. Cohn (2012) argues that comic uses any combination of writing and images such as single images, sequential images, and some writings. Bonnef in Soedarso (2015) states that comic is consists of two types, namely comic strips and comic books. Salor & Marasligil (2013) explain that in translating comic is about translating language. It involves playing with words, knowing about the target language and the target reader, being creative is needed, having feeling for the original story. Thus, the language used in translating comic is non-standard language or relaxed language. In this case, shift in translation process will occur in the grammatical structure, class of word, unit level, and also system.

That is the reason why the researcher focuses on translation shift theory stated by Catford (1965). Therefore, the researcher is interested to analyze category shift on the comic translation from English into Indonesian that has different structure and form between source language (SL) and target language (TL). Through this research, the researcher will find out some shift in



translating process and also the influence on transferring meaning from source language into the target language.

### Methodology

This research is descriptive qualitative method. In this research the researcher analyzes the translation shifts especially category shift according to Catford's theory (1965) that occurred on the English comic translated into Indonesian by the third semester students in Visual Translation subject of English Department, Tidar University. In this research, the researcher takes fourteen samples of comic translation works from class A and B. The technique of data collection is documentation. The researcher uses some procedures in analyzing the data of the category shift used in translating comic from English into Indonesian, as follows:

1. Taking all the data of comic translation from English into Indonesian from class A and class B.
2. Reading the comic translation that was translated by the third semester students.
3. Identifying the types of category shift (structure shift, class shift, unit shift and intra-system shift) based on Catford's theory (1965).
4. Tabulating the category shift found in the source language into a table
5. Analyzing the influence on transferring meaning in translation from source language into target language.
6. Tabulating it into a same table.
7. Rating the data of some category shift occurred in the form of percentage. The researcher also calculated the influencing on transferring meaning that occurred on the translating comic. The formula to count the percentage, as follows.

$$\text{Percentage: } \frac{F}{N} \times 100$$

**P** = Percentage

**F** = Number of types of category shift/meaning equivalence

**N** = total number of category shift/meaning equivalence

8. Tabulating the result of analysis
9. Drawing the result of analysis of the occurrence of category shift and the degree of meaning equivalence into the table as follows.
10. The last procedure, drawing a conclusion based on the analysis and suggestion.
11. Validating the data



## Finding(s) and Discussion

### The Occurrence of Category Shift

Table 1. The Occurrence of Category Shift

No	Types of Category Shift	Frequency	Percentage
1.	Structure Shift	122	38.125%
2.	Class Shift	44	13.75%
3.	Unit Shift	116	36.25%
4.	Intra-System Shift	38	11.875%
Total		320	100%

Based on the data in the table above, it shows that the total of category shift occurred on the comic translation from English into Indonesian translated by the third semester students are 320 shifts. The highest frequency is structure shift because the researcher found many different structures especially the changing of the position of words in the SL and TL on the comic translated by the third semester students. There are 122 cases or 38.125%. The lowest shift is intra-system shift with total 38 cases or 11.875% out of the total 320 cases. Intra-system shift happened on the comic translation because the different system internally between SL and TL. The data proves there are changing from plural to singular form. Unit shift occurred 116 cases or 36.25%. It occurred because the translators translate many English expressions in the different rank. In this case, unit shift happened in the changing from a higher into a lower rank and vice versa. Meanwhile, class shift occurred 44 cases or 13.75%. From the data, the researcher found some cases of the occurrence of class shift. Sometimes, the translators are not able to maintain the word class in the SL. Therefore, they use different class to make the expression in the TL more acceptable and suitable.

### Analysis of Category Shift

#### Structure Shift

Structure shift involves a grammatical structure change between the structures of SL and TL. It can be occurred in the different arrangement of word order both of two languages.

The data is taken from  $S_1C_2E_3$

SL: An extra snow shovel

TL: Sebuah sekop salju besar

The noun phrase in the SL is “an extra snow shovel”. The pattern of noun phrase in the SL is article+ adjective + noun. But, when the translator translated into TL there is a different pattern between SL and TL. The noun phrase is translated into “Sebuah sekop salju besar”. It shows that the word order of noun phrase occurred. It means that, there is a structure shift in the process of translating in TL. If the translator changes literally, the meaning will be “sebuah besar salju sekop”. It makes the meaning of noun phrase in TL is meaningless. The reader will not get the meaning in SL. Therefore, to hold the meaning in translation, the translator changes the structure to keep the meaning in TL.



### Class Shift

Class shift happened when part of speech or word class in the SL change in the TL. It means that there is a different class from original item and a shift occurred.

The data is taken from S<sub>14</sub>C<sub>2</sub>E<sub>8</sub>

SL: *Y' sure better return it in a hurry, unca Donald*

TL: *Sungguh lebih baik kau mengembalikannya dengan cepat, Paman Donald*

From the example above, it indicates there is a change of class word. Based on the context at the figure above, Unca Donald brings a shovel through the snow. He intends to return it because he knows that Mr. Jones has a bad temper. His nephews also said that their uncle must give a shovel in a hurry. The expression of “hurry” is a verb in the source language. It has equivalent meaning in Bahasa Indonesia “tergesa-gesa / buru-buru” as a verb. But, in this translation the translator translates into “cepat” as an adjective, which means “moving quickly”. It indicates that there is a translation shift from the changing verb into adjective. If the translator change the meaning of “hurry” into “tergesa-gesa / buru-buru”, the sentence sounds strange in Bahasa Indonesia.

### Unit Shift

Unit shift means change of rank. There is a shift of unit from SL into TL. It occurred differently, from the lower unit to higher unit or from the higher unit to lower unit.

The data is taken from S<sub>1</sub>C<sub>1</sub>E<sub>6</sub>

SL: *Great! What a ride! Let's get some other kids and charge 'em.*

TL: *Luar biasa! mengesankan! ayo kita ajak beberapa anak dan meminta bayaran.*

From that example, it can be seen that there is a unit shift that occurs from a lower rank becomes a higher rank. It is shown that the translator translated the adjective word of “great” into adjective phrase “luar biasa”. Based on the figure above, Calvin tells his feeling about the ride. It makes him has an unforgettable moment because they can fly high. Thus, he compliments the ride and decides to invite other friends. Actually, the word “great” also can be translated become “hebat”, but the translator change into “luar biasa”. Although, in English language the adjective phrase of “luar biasa” the meaning is excellent. However it is not the problem because the synonym of “great” is “excellent”.

### Intra-System Shift

Intra-system shift is a shift happened internally, within a system of language. It occurred when a term is plural in SL and its equivalent is singular, or vice versa.

The data is taken from S<sub>2</sub>C<sub>1</sub>E<sub>6</sub>

SL: *Great! What a ride! Let's get some other kids and charge 'em.*

TL: *Bagus! Tumpangan yang keren! mari temukan beberapa anak lain dan kumpulkan mereka!!*

The noun phrase of the example above in the SL is “some other kids”. It shows that the phrase is translated into “beberapa anak lain” in TL. The morpheme-s of word “kids” is a plural. In Bahasa Indonesia the plural word has special characteristic by repeating the word twice. The word “kids” has corresponding system with “anak-anak”. In this translation, the translator



changed the phrase of “some other kids” into “*beberapa anak lain*” in the TL. It will become unnatural *Bahasa Indonesia* when it is changed into “*beberapa anak-anak lain*”. In fact, the expression the word “some (beberapa)” is quantifier that showing the plurality. It proved that a noun (kid) after quantifier (some) is more than one. Therefore, the word “kids” is translated into “*anak*” in the TL, although it has corresponding system in English as the SL.

### The Occurrence of Meaning Equivalence

Table 2. the Occurrence of Meaning Equivalence

No	Types of Meaning Equivalence	Frequency	Percentage
1.	Complete Meaning	96	38.4%
2.	Increased Meaning	24	9.6%
3.	Decreased Meaning	30	12%
4.	Lost Meaning	35	14%
5.	Different Meaning	65	26%
Total		250	100%

Based on the table 2 above, it can be seen that the highest frequency is complete meaning because the translators maintain the information in the SL and there are no add or omit the information. Thus, the message between SL and TL is same. There are 96 data or 38.4% categorized as the complete meaning. Then, 24 data or 9.6% belongs to increased meaning. From the analyzing of the data, increased meaning happened because the translators add some words or information in the TL in order to make the message clearly. Decreased meaning occurred 30 times or 12%. In this case, the translators try to translate the information as simply but it did not change all the content of meaning. They just omit some information in the SL. While in non-equivalent meaning, 35 or 14% belongs to lost meaning. It occurred because the researcher found some words in SL eliminated. Therefore, the target language loses some information. There are 65 cases or 26% belongs to different meaning. Based on the data, different meaning occurred because the translators translate the word into different meaning. Sometimes, it caused the meaning in TL is not appropriate with the context. From the data above, the lowest meaning is increased meaning and the highest meaning is complete meaning. It proved that in the process of transferring message from SL into TL, the translator still maintains the original meaning to get the equivalence meaning.

### Analysis of Meaning Equivalence

#### *Complete Meaning*

Complete meaning happened when the translator transferred the meaning from source language into target language completely without omitting or adding the words.

The data is taken from S<sub>12</sub>C<sub>2</sub>E<sub>5</sub>

SL: *That's the shovel y' borrowed from Mr. Jones last winter!*

TL: *Itu sekop yang kau pinjam dari Pak Jones musim dingin lalu!*

From the example above, it shows that the whole message in the SL appeared in the TL. Based on the figure, Unca Donald and his nephews are talking about the shovel. They have not returned it before. In this case, the translator also uses translation shift especially structure shift and unit shift in. However, by this shift the translator still maintain the meaning in the TL.





### Increased Meaning

Increased meaning happened when the translator adds some information in the TL in which the information is not found in the SL.

The data is taken from S<sub>3</sub>C<sub>2</sub>E<sub>8</sub>

SL: *And he is the big guy with the bad temper*

TL: *Dan dia adalah seorang pria berbadan besar dengan watak yang buruk!*

Based on the example above, the translator adds some expression such as “*seorang*”, “*berbadan*”, and “*yang*” in the target language. It makes the meaning to be increased in the TL. Whereas, there is adding some information, but the content of SL does not change. The function of the addition is to clarify clearly about the messages in the SL. It seen from the translator who translates the noun phrase of “the big guy” become “*seorang pria berbadan besar*” which is the translator wants to explain and give information accurately about “the big guy” in the SL. Therefore, the translator adds some information that is not found in the SL. It makes the expression in TL easier to be understood by the reader.

### Decreased Meaning

Decreased meaning happened when the translator omitted some information in the source language. It causes the information in the target language does not appear.

The data is taken from S<sub>5</sub>C<sub>1</sub>E<sub>4</sub>

SL: Let's go

TL: Ayo

In this case, there is a shift meaning from SL into TL. It is from the omission information of SL. It makes the meaning in the TL decreased. It can be seen from the sentence “*let's go*”. Let's is the abbreviation from let us, it has meaning in Bahasa Indonesia “*mari / ayo*”. Let's usually use to invite someone to do something. After “let's” is followed by verb-1. Thus, if we translate the sentence let's go the meaning in TL is “*ayo kita pergi*”, but the translator omit “*kita pergi*” in order to achieve the effectiveness. Even though, there is an omission of information in the TL, but it does not influence the meaning in TL and the message still understandable.

### Different Meaning

Different meaning occurred when the translator changed the information of source language into target language by using word that has different meaning.

The data is taken from S<sub>12</sub>C<sub>2</sub>E<sub>1</sub>

SL: *C'mon, boys, I'm gonna get some extra blankets down from the attic.*

TL: *Ayo anak-anak, aku akan mengambil beberapa selimut besar dari loteng*

In the example above, there is a different meaning between SL and TL. It shows from the verb phrase of “*get down*” which means to bring something down from a higher place. In this case, the translator is able to translate into “*membawa turun*” in TL. However, in the TL it changed into “*mengambil*”. Although, there is a different meaning in the translating meaning from SL into TL, but it does not change all the contexts delivered from SL into TL. The reader still understands about the context because the people's mind the location of the attic is in the higher place of house. It means that “*unca donald*” based on the story will take the blankets from the attic and bring it to the first floor.



### Lost Meaning

Lost meaning occurred when the translator eliminated all the information in SL. It causes the information in the TL lost and not transferred.

The data is taken from S<sub>10</sub>C<sub>2</sub>E<sub>11</sub>

SL: **Leave no milk** have gone to Florida for the winter

TL: Telah pergi ke Florida untuk musim dingin

The context based on the figure above is about Unca Donald who visits Mr. Jones's house to return the shovel. Unfortunately, he finds a paper on the Mr. Jones's door. Mr. Jones writes a message that they go to Florida for the winter. In the example above, the translator also does not transfer the meaning of "leave no milk". It causes the information of TL is not equal with the information in the SL. It occurred because the translator thought that it is not necessary to translate it. The readers will catch the meaning and the context of the message because the important part of the message is Mr. Jones tells to all people that he had gone to Florida for the winter.

### Conclusion(s)

Based on the data analysis above, the researcher draws the following conclusion. From the data analysis and discussion have been done, the conclusion from four types of category shift occurred on the comic translation from English into Indonesian translated by the third semester students in Visual Translation subject. They are structure shift, class shift, unit shift and intra-system shift. The dominant shift occurred on the comic translation is structure shift. It means that to make the text in SL more suitable and communicative in the TL, the translators must change the grammatical structure in the TL. The equivalence meaning found on the comic translation from English into Indonesian consists of complete meaning, increased meaning, and decreased meaning. Then, the non-equivalent meaning involves lost meaning and different meaning. From finding and discussion, it can be concluded that the dominant of equivalence meaning is complete meaning. By shifting the translators are able to maintain the message of SL. Not only that, the visual media like comic helps the translators to translate the message from SL. Translators can consider the context of situation based on the picture. It makes the translation more accurate and acceptable to the target reader.

### References

- Akbari, M. (2012). Structural Shifts in Translation Shifts of Children's Literature. *International Journal of Linguistics*. Vol. 4(2).
- Alzuhdy, Y. A. (2014). Analisis Translation Shift dalam Penerjemahan Bilingual Bahasa Inggris – Bahasa Indonesia. *Diksi Jurnal Ilmiah Bahasa, Sastra dan Pengajarannya*. Vol. 22(2).
- Catford, J. C. (1965). *A Linguistic Theory of Translation*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Cohn, N. (2012). *Comics, linguistics, and visual language: The past and future of a field*. In Bramlett, Frank (ed). *Linguistics and the Study of Comics*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan
- Hatim, B. (2013). *Teaching and Reseraching Translation Second Edition*. New York: Routledge.



This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/).



- Herman. (2014). Category Shifts in the English Translation of Harry Potter and the Philosopher's Stone Movie Subtitle into Indonesian (An Applied Linguistic Study). *IOSR Journal of Humanities and Social Science (IOSR-JHSS)*. Vol. 19 (12), 31-38
- Herman. (2017). Shift in Translation from English into Indonesian on Narrative Text. *International Journal of European Studies*, Vol. 1 (3), 72-77
- Hussaeni, S., Pratama, H. & Hartono, R. (2018). Semantic Shift in the English-Indonesian Translation of Dessen's What Happened to Good Bye. *English Education on Journal*. Vol. 8 (2). 195-207.
- Jayantini, S. R. (2016). *The Art of Translating: Theory and Analysis*. Denpasar-Bali: Cakra Press.
- Karina, E. D. & Padang, N. (2017). Translation Shifts in Bilingual Story Book Barbie "Kumpulan Cerita Putri". *International Journal of Language Learning Applied Linguistics World (IJLLALW)*, Vol. 16(1), 81-92.
- Panou, D. (2013). Equivalence in Translation Theories: A Critical Evaluation. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, Vol. 3 (1), 1-6.
- Prihastanti, M. S. (2014). *An Analysis of Structure Shifts in the English-Bahasa Indonesian of L. Frank Baum's the Marvelous Land of Oz' Novel Text*. Thesis. Yogyakarta: Yogyakarta State University.
- Salor & Marasligil. (2013). Translating Comics. In *Norwich Paper*. Vol. 21. Published by the University of East Anglia in 2013
- Soedarso, N. (2015). Komik: Karya Sastra Bergambar. *Humaniora*, Vol. 6 (4), 496-506
- Yarahmadzahi, N. & Moghadam, M. Y. (2017). Shifts in Coordinate and Correlative Conjunctions in Translations from English to Persian Language. *International Journal of English Language & Translation Studies*, Vol. 5(4), 7-13

